COMSATS University Islamabad

Park Road, Tarlai Kalan, Islamabad
Tel: 051-9247000, Ext: 313 Fax: 051-92470006

Building Section

****

CUI/WD/026/208-A

April 9, 2022

Bid Evaluation Report (Technical & Financial)

As per rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004

1	Name of Procuring Agency	COMSATS University Islamabad (CUI).
2	Method of Procurement	Quality and Cost Based Selection
3	Title of Procurement	Pre-Qualification of Consulting Engineers/ Architect Firms for Master Planning and Engineering Services for COMSATS University Islamabad (CUI), Kot Addu Campus
4	Tender Inquiry No.	CUI/P&D and HRD-1(256)/21
5	PPRA Ref. No. (TSE)	TS466384E
6	Date &Time of Bid Closing	December 21, 2021 at 1500 hrs
7	Date & Time of Bid Opening	December 21, 2021 at 1530 hrs
8	No. of Bids Received	Twelve
9	Criteria for Bid Evaluation	Attached.
10	Detail of Bid(s) Evaluation	Attached.

Name of Bidder	Marks		Evaluated Cost	Rule/Regulation/SBD */policy/ Basis for Rejection/ Acceptance as per Rules 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
	Technical (if applicable)	Financial (if applicable)		
M/s Naqvi & Siddiquie	Y	Y	66.85	4th Position
M/s Master Consulting Engineers Pvt. Ltd.	Y	Y	79.59	2nd Position
M/s ES Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd.	Y	Y	56.64	5th Position
M/s Development Consultancy Services (Pvt.) Ltd.	Y	Y	79.17	3rd Position
M/s Designmen Consulting Engineers Pvt. Ltd.	Y	Y	86.79	1st Position

Evaluated Bidder: M/s Designmen Consulting Engineers Pvt. Ltd.

11. Any other additional/supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share.

Signature: ____________________

Official Stamp: Mazhar Ali Khan
Assistant Program Officer
COMSATS University Islamabad (CUI)

com ~~[illegible]~~.
com 11522.

Request for Proposal of "Expression of Interest" for Pre-Qualification of Consulting Engineers/Architects Firms for Master Planning and Engineering Services for COMSATS University Islamabad (CUI), Kot Addu Campus

Financial Bid Evaluation

Sr. No.	Description	Total Marks	Lowest rates from all bids	M/s Designmen Consulting Engineer (Pvt) Ltd.		M/s Naqvi & Siddiquie		M/s Development Consultancy Services (Pvt.) Ltd.		M/s Master Consulting Engineers Pvt. Ltd.		M/s ES Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd.	
				Financial bid value	Marks Obtained	Financial bid value	Marks Obtained	Financial bid value	Marks Obtained	Financial bid value	Marks Obtained	Financial bid value	Marks Obtained
		z	a	b	(a/b)*z	c	(a/c)*z	d	(a/d)*z	d	(a/d)*z	d	(a/d)*z
1	Schematic Design of Master Plan	10	600,000	600,000	10.000	8,500,000	0.706	5,500,000	1.091	750,000	8.000	1,500,000	4.000
2	**Design of Individual Building:** Schematic Design; Design Development Phase; Executive Project Phase (Tender Documentation / Evaluation of Bids).sign of Individual Building	30	0.4786	0.500	28.716	2.450	5.860	0.650	22.089	0.4786	30.000	5.000	2.872
3	**Design of Infrastructure:** Schematic Design; Design Development Phase; Executive Project Phase (Tender Documentation / Evaluation of Bids).	20	0.0786	0.300	5.240	2.250	0.699	0.500	3.144	0.0786	20.000	3.000	0.524
4	**Repeat Design for Buildings:** Schematic Design; Design Development Phase; Executive Project Phase (Tender Documentation / Evaluation of Bids).	10	0.2500	0.250	10.000	1.500	1.667	0.550	4.545	0.2786	8.973	5.000	0.500
5	Detail construction supervision cost of works on completion for period as specified in tender documents	30	0.5500	0.550	30.000	2.650	6.226	1.450	11.379	0.7860	20.992	2.000	8.250
	Total marks obtained in financial bid, out of 100	100			83.96		15.16		42.25		87.97		16.15
	Financial score calculated in 30 = (F)				25.19		4.55		12.67		26.39		4.84
	Total marked obtained in technical bid, out of 100.				88.00		89.00		95.00		76.00		74.00
	Technical score calculated in 70 = (T)				61.60		62.30		66.50		53.20		51.80
	Total Score (Financial + Technical) becomes = (F+T)				86.79		66.85		79.17		79.59		56.64
	Conclusion				1st		4th		3rd		2nd		5th

	26-4-22	26/4/22
Aamir Yousufzai Senior Manager (P&D) Convener	Anwar Kamal Senior Engineer (Civil) Member/Secretary	Sajid Gill Assistant Treasurer Member

Technical Bid Evaluation Report

Master Planning and Engineering Services for the Establishment of Permanent Campus of COMSATS University Islamabad (CUI), Kot Addu Campus

S.No.	Description	Evaluation Criteria			M/s Designmen Consulting Engineers (Pvt) Lts.	M/s Naqvi & Siddique	M/s Development Consultancy Services (Pvt) Ltd.	M/s Master Consulting Engineers (Pvt) Ltd.	M/s ES Consultant (Pvt) Ltd.
		A	B	C					
		Maximum Marks	Sub-division of Marks of Column A	Sub-division of Marks of Column B					
1	**Company Status**	5	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
	1.1 - Public Sector	-	-	5	-	-	-	-	-
	1.2 - Company	-	-	5	5	-	5	5	5
	1.3 - Partnership	-	-	4	-	4	-	-	-
	1.4 -Sole proprietor	-	-	3	-	-	-	-	-
2	**Qualification of relevant technical staff**	30	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
	Designing				-	-	-	-	-
2.1	**Architect**	-	5	-	-	-	-	-	-
	2.1.1 - Based on Experience				-	-	-	-	-
	2.1.1 .1- Experience more than 20 years	-	-	3	3	3	3	3	3
	2.1.1 .2- Experience 10 to 20 years	-	-	2	-	-	-	-	-
	2.1.1 .3- Experience upto 10 years	-	-	1	-	-	-	-	-
	2.1.2 - Based on number of persons				-	-	-	-	-
	2.1.2 .1- More than 2 persons	-	-	2	2	2	2	2	-
	2.1.2 .2- 2 persons	-	-	1	-	-	-	-	1
	2.1.2 .3- 1 person	-	-	0.5	-	-	-	-	-
2.2	**Structure Engineer**	-	5		-	-	-	-	-
	2.2.1 - Based on Experience				-	-	-	-	-
	2.2.1.1- Experience more than 20 years	-	-	3	3	-	3	3	3
	2.2.1 .2- Experience 10 to 20 years	-	-	2	-	-	-	-	-

30-3-22

30/3/22

S.No.	Description	Evaluation Criteria			M/s Designmen Consulting Engineers (Pvt) Lts.	M/s Naqvi & Siddique	M/s Development Consultancy Services (Pvt) Ltd.	M/s Master Consulting Engineers (Pvt) Ltd.	M/s ES Consultant (Pvt) Ltd.
		A	B	C					
		Maximum Marks	Sub-division of Marks of Column A	Sub-division of Marks of Column B					
	2.2.1 .3- Experience upto 10 years	-	-	1.	-	-	-	-	-
	2.2.2 - Based on number of persons				-	-	-	-	-
	2.2.2 .1- More than 2 persons	-	-	2	2	-	2	2	-
	2.2.2 .2- 2 persons	-	-	1	-	-	-	-	-
	2.2.2 .3- 1 person	-	-	0.5	-	-	-	-	0.5
2.3	**Public Health Engineer**	-	5		-	-	-	-	-
	2.3.1 - Based on Experience				-	-	-	-	-
	2.3.1.1 - Experience more than 20 years	-	-	3	-	3	3	3	3
	2.3.1 .2- Experience 10 to 20 years	-	-	2	2	-	-	-	-
	2.3.1 .3- Experience upto 10 years	-	-	1	-	-	-	-	-
	2.3.2 - Based on number of persons				-	-	-	-	-
	2.3.2 .1- More than 2 persons	-	-	2	2	2	2	2	-
	2.3.2 .2- 2 persons	-	-	1	-	-	-	-	-
	2.3.2 .3- 1 person	-	-	0.5	-	-	-	-	0.5
2.4	**Electrical/ Mechanical Engineer**	-	5		-	-	-	-	-
	2.4.1 - Based on Experience				-	-	-	-	-
	2.4.1.1 - Experience more than 20 years	-	-	3	-	3	3	3	3
	2.4.1 .2- Experience 10 to 20 years	-	-	2	2	-	-	-	-
	2.4.1 .3- Experience upto 10 years	-	-	1	-	-	-	-	-
	2.4.2 - Based on number of persons				-	-	-	-	-
	2.4.2 .1- More than 2 persons	-	-	2	2	2	2	2	-
	2.4.2 .2- 2 persons	-	-	1	-	-	-	-	1
	2.4.2 .3- 1 person	-	-	0.5	-	-	-	-	-
	Site Supervision				-	-	-	-	-

30-3-22

30/3/22

S.No.	Description	Evaluation Criteria			M/s Designmen Consulting Engineers (Pvt) Lts.	M/s Naqvi & Siddique	M/s Development Consultancy Services (Pvt) Ltd.	M/s Master Consulting Engineers (Pvt) Ltd.	M/s ES Consultant (Pvt) Ltd.
		A	B	C					
		Maximum Marks	Sub-division of Marks of Column A	Sub-division of Marks of Column B					
2.5	**Resident Engineer & Supervision Staff**	-	10	.	-	-	-	-	-
	2.5.1 - Based on Experience				-	-	-	-	-
	2.5.1.1 - Experience more than 20 years	-	-	5	4*	5	5	5	5
	2.5.1 .2- Experience 10 to 20 years	-	-	3	-	-	-	-	-
	2.5.1 .3- Experience upto 10 years	-	-	1	-	-	-	-	-
	2.5.2 - Based on number of persons				-	-	-	-	-
	2.5.2 .1- More than 2 Teams	-	-	5	5	5	5	5	-
	2.5.2 .2- 2 Teams	-	-	3	-	-	-	-	-
	2.5.2 .3- 1 Team	-	-	1	-	-	-	-	1
3	**Experience with similar projects**	40	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
	3.1.1 - Similar Works Completed in last 5 years	-	10	-	10	10	10	10	10
	3.1.2 - Similar Works in Hand	-	10	-	10	10	10	10	0
	3.1.3 - Overall projects completed in last 5 years	-	5	-	5	5	5	5	5
	3.1.4 - Green field campus:	-	15	-	15	15	15	0	15
	Master planning, Designing of (Buildings & Infrastructure works) and Supervision.								
4	**Adequacy of the proposed work plan and methodology in the technical proposal**	25	-	-	16	20	20	16	18
	TOTAL	100	-	-	88	89	95	76	74

* Marks were assigned pursuant to Article-B of ANNEX-D (ii) on page No. 22 of the RFP.

Note: For a firm to be prequalified, score should be 70 or more

30-3-22
(Anwar Kamal)
Senior Engineer/Member Secretary TSSC

30/3/22
(Sajid Gill)
Assistant Treasurer/Member TSSC

(M. Tahir Shahzad)
Senior Project Manager/Co-Opted Member

(Aamir Yousufzai)
Senior Manager/Convener TSSC

of the firms who wish to attend the meeting. The time and date of the financial bid opening will be communicated at a later time.

8 SUBMISSION, RECEIPT AND OPENING OF PROPOSALS

Submit Technical Proposal placed in a sealed envelope clearly marked "Technical Proposal," along with Financial Proposal in a separate sealed envelope clearly marked "Financial Proposal" and warning: "Do not open with the Technical Proposal." Both envelopes shall be placed into an outer sealed envelope bearing the submission address and other information indicated in the Data Sheet and clearly marked, "DO NOT OPEN, EXCEPT IN THE PRESENCE OF THE EVALUATION COMMITTEE."

The completed technical and financial proposals must be delivered at the submission address on or before **March 22, 2022** not later than **1500 hrs.** Any proposal received after the closing time shall be returned unopened. The technical proposals will be opened on the same day at **1530 hrs.** in the presence of the representatives of pre-qualified consultants, if they wish to be present.

9 PROPOSAL EVALUATION

9.1 General

The firms shall not contact any official of the COMSATS University Islamabad (CUI) on any matter relating to their proposal from the time of submission of the Technical and Financial Proposal to the time the contract is awarded. If a firm wishes to bring additional information to the notice of the client, it should do so in writing at the address indicated in the Data Sheet. Evaluators of technical proposals shall have no access to the financial proposals until the technical evaluation is concluded.

9.2 Technical Proposal

The technical committee will carry out the evaluation of proposals on the basis of their responsiveness to the RFP, applying the evaluation criteria and point system specified in the Data Sheet. The Client will notify firms for the rejection of their technical proposal indicating that their financial proposals if any will be returned unopened after completing the selection process.

9.3 Financial Proposal

The Client will notify in writing the technically qualified consultants the date, time and address indicated in the Data Sheet, for opening the financial proposals. The opening date shall not be sooner than 5 calendar days after the notification date. The notification may be sent by registered letter, cable telex, facsimile, or electronic mail.

On opening the financial proposals in the presence of the representatives of the consultants who choose to attend, the Client will announce the names of the consultants, the technical scores, and the amounts of their financial proposals.

10 DISCLAIMER